

# Table of Contents

INTRODUCTION.....	13
PART ONE: CROSS BORDER CARTELS IN LATIN AMERICA .....	20
Chapter 1: Cross-Border Cartels and the Latin American Competition Policy Context.....	22
1.1. Definition of cross-border cartels.....	22
1.1.1. Cartels as horizontal agreements between competitors.....	23
1.1.2. Overt (explicit) vs. covert (tacit) collusion .....	26
1.1.3. Harmful effects of cross-border cartels in developing countries .....	29
1.1.4. International vs. domestic cartels .....	30
1.1.5. CBCs and CAPs .....	30
1.1.6. Private vs. public cartels.....	31
1.2. Classification of mature, large, young and small competition authorities .....	32
1.3. Competition law and policy developments in Latin America .....	36
1.3.1. National cartel cases with regional cross-border dimensions .....	39
1.3.2. Four central aspects of anti-cartel enforcement .....	40
1.3.3. Domestic cartel cases in the region .....	44
1.4. Summary .....	47
Chapter 2: Classification of Cross-Border Cartels and their Impact in Latin America: .....	48
2.1. Rationale for classifying cross-border cartels and the implications for this research.....	49
2.1.1. Types of cross-border cartels .....	52
2.1.1.1. Export cross-border cartels.....	53
2.1.1.2. Import cross-border cartels.....	55
2.1.1.3. Regional cross-border cartels .....	57
2.1.1.4. Multinational cross-border cartels.....	59
2.1.1.5. Transnational cross-border cartels.....	66
2.2. Cross-border cartels in Latin America: when domestic enforcement builds the basis to effectively address the harmful effects of cross-border cartels.....	72
2.2.1. Mexico: the lysine cartel (1998).....	73
2.2.2. Brazil: the vitamins cartel (2007).....	73
2.2.3. Colombia: the auto-parts cartel (2012).....	74
2.2.4. Chile: the shipping cartel (2015).....	75
2.2.5. Colombia: the sugar import cartel (2015) .....	75
2.2.6. Brazil: the refrigeration compressor cartel (2016) .....	76
2.2.7. Colombia: the nappy cartel (2016).....	77
2.2.8. Peru: the roll-on roll-off cargo cartel (2017).....	77
2.3. Summary .....	78
Chapter 3: Theory and Practice of International Cooperation .....	79
3.1. The need to cooperate between mature and young competition authorities .....	80
3.1.1. Phases in which international cooperation in cartel investigations takes place .....	82
3.2. The role of politics in international cooperation .....	84
3.3. Tools for international cooperation and information sharing.....	86
3.3.1. Formal cooperation .....	86
3.3.2. Informal cooperation.....	90
3.4. International soft-law institutions.....	91
3.4.1. The work of the Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development on international cooperation.....	92

3.4.2. The work of the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development on international cooperation .....	94
3.4.3. The work of the International Competition Network on cartels and leniency .....	97
3.5. Summary .....	100
Chapter 4: Existing Efforts to Detect and Prosecute Cross-Border Cartels in Latin America .....	102
4.1. Bilateral agreements and competition chapters in regional trade agreements signed by Latin American competition authorities .....	103
4.2. Assessing the sub-regional competition platforms in Latin America .....	106
4.3. Parallel domestic cartel investigations in Latin America: the liquid oxygen cartel cases .....	111
4.4. The rise of informal cooperation arrangements: the Lima Declaration of 2013 .....	115
4.5. Summary .....	117
<b>PART TWO: ISSUES ARISING FROM CROSS-BORDER COOPERATION IN MULTIJURISDICTIONAL CARTEL ENFORCEMENT .....</b>	<b>119</b>
Chapter 5: Multinational Cross-Border Cartel Investigations: Trust, Culture and Optimal Deterrence .....	121
5.1. Lack of an overall trust between mature and young competition authorities .....	122
5.1.1. Lack of repeated personal interaction .....	123
5.1.2. Lack of shared interests and values .....	124
5.1.3. Lack of understanding .....	125
5.1.4. Lack of joint activities .....	126
5.2. Legal culture barriers to cooperation .....	127
5.3. Lack of incentives to cooperate .....	129
5.3.1. The extraterritorial application of competition laws .....	134
5.4. Difficulties in achieving comparable sanctions and remedies to cartel infringements .....	138
Chapter 6: Issues Hindering Cooperation in Transnational Cross-Border Cartel Investigations: Leniency, Confidentiality and Physical Presence .....	140
6.1. Differences in leniency regimes between mature and young competition authorities' jurisdictions .....	141
6.1.1. Lack of effective implementation of leniency programmes in young competition authorities .....	141
6.1.2. Lack of trust by the leniency applicants in providing a confidentiality waiver to young competition authorities .....	142
6.1.3. Lack of specific cooperation arrangements of mutual recognition in leniency and immunity issues .....	144
6.2. Lack of an international definition of confidential information .....	145
6.3. Lack of physical presence .....	150
6.4. Summary .....	151
Chapter 7: Issues for Young or Small Competition Authorities in Investigating Regional Cross-Border Cartels .....	154
7.1. Lack of effective regional competition authorities .....	157
7.2. Different legal standings as per cartel offenses .....	159
7.2.1. Dual criminality .....	160
7.2.2. Implementation of Mutual Legal Assistance Treaties (MLATs): .....	162

7.2.3. Limitations of the use of information .....	163
7.2.4. Diversity in the level of protection of due process rights .....	164
7.2.5. Differences of the conceptualisation of cartels and goals that competition policy and law should pursue .....	164
7.3. Diverse set of rules concerning the powers of investigation .....	165
7.4. Diverse adjudication techniques .....	166
7.5. Summary .....	167
Chapter 8: Issues Related to Export and Import Cross-Border Cartel Investigations .....	169
8.1.1. Lack of incentives and willingness to investigate export cross-border cartels .....	170
8.1.2. Lack of a compulsory agreement to gather information .....	171
8.2. Issues in import cross-border cartel investigations .....	172
8.2.1. Lack of incentives and willingness to investigate import cross-border cartels .....	172
8.2.2. Limitations on the admissibility of foreign evidence .....	174
8.3. Summary .....	175
<b>PART THREE: PAST SOLUTIONS AND NOVEL PROPOSALS TO SELECTED TYPES OF CROSS-BORDER CARTELS .....</b>	<b>177</b>
Chapter 9: Past Solutions to the Problem of Cross-Border Cartels .....	180
9.1. Most common solutions to improve cooperation in multinational and transnational cross-border cartel investigations .....	181
9.1.1. Addressing the differences in leniency applications: alignment of leniency requirements across mature and young jurisdictions through "one-stop shop" Models .....	182
9.1.2. Overcoming cultural legal barriers against cooperation: joint investigative teams and cross-appointments .....	183
9.1.3. Addressing the lack of an international definition of confidential information: information gateways and appropriate safeguards .....	184
9.1.4. Addressing the difficulties in achieving comparable sanctions and remedies for cartel infringements: cooperation at court level .....	186
9.1.5. Summary of the previously proposed solutions .....	187
9.2. Most common partial solutions to improve cooperation in regional, export, and import CBC investigations .....	188
9.2.1. Solutions proposed for regional cross-border cartel investigations .....	188
9.2.1.1. Addressing the lack of effective regional competition authorities: the international private law solution .....	188
9.2.1.2. Addressing different legal standings of cartel offenses: appointment of one or more lead jurisdiction(s) in cross-border cases .....	191
9.2.1.3. Addressing the diverse criteria in adjudication techniques: recognition of decisions made by agencies or courts in other jurisdictions .....	193
9.2.2. A solution proposed for export cross-border cartel proceedings: foreign states' amicus curiae to domestic competition cases .....	194
9.2.3. Addressing import cross-border cartel investigations: recognition of foreign evidence provided by affected exporters .....	196
9.3. Summary .....	198
Chapter 10: Proposals to Strengthen Cooperation Between Mature and Young Competition Authorities in Transnational Cross-Border Cartel Investigations .....	202

10.1. Introducing calculus-based trust activities between mature and young competition authorities .....	203
10.1.1. The conceptual framework of trust development.....	203
10.1.1.1. Deterrence-based or calculus-based trust .....	205
10.1.1.2. Knowledge-based trust .....	206
10.1.1.3. Identification-based trust (IBT).....	207
10.1.2. How the framework is applicable to competition authorities' business model...	207
10.1.3. The role of technical assistance and capacity building in creating trust between mature and young competition authorities .....	208
10.2. Setting up an international benchmark for the definition of "sharable information" .....	210
10.2.1. Disaggregating the types of information needed to tackle transnational cross-border cartels .....	212
10.2.2. Measures to implement conditional information gateways to sharable information in the absence of effective leniency programmes in younger competition authorities .....	218
10.3. Strengthening the ICN Framework for promotion of sharing non-confidential information for cartel enforcement.....	220
10.3.1. Weaving the UN mechanism into the ICN.....	222
10.3.2. Inserting key features of the voluntary consultation mechanism provided under Section F.4 of the UN set of competition .....	226
10.4. Summary .....	230
 Chapter 11: Proposals to Strengthen Cooperation Among Young Competition Authorities in Regional Cross-Border Cartel Investigations: the Case of Latin America .....	232
11.1. From calculus-based trust (CBT) to knowledge-based trust (KBT) activities in regional competition law enforcement .....	234
11.1.1. How trust has developed in certain Latin American sub-regional groupings and networks of competition authorities in the region.....	235
11.1.2. Proposed measures to strengthen trust amongst young competition authorities for regional cross-border cartel investigations.....	237
11.1.3. Specific measures to implement ad-hoc information gateways to agency information among young competition authorities .....	240
11.2. Coordination games which can strengthen informal cooperation settings and networks in Latin America .....	241
11.2.1. The conceptual framework: the problem of cooperation vs. the problem of coordination .....	242
11.2.1.1. The assurance or "stag hunt" game .....	244
11.2.1.2. The battle of the sexes game .....	245
11.2.2. Applying coordination games to cross-border cooperation of young competition authorities .....	246
11.2.3. A novel proposal to strengthen informal coordination through "coordination games" in Latin America.....	248
11.2.3.1. The rationale of the stag hunt game .....	248
11.2.3.2. Solving the coordination problem .....	249
11.2.3.3. A hypothetical case: the airline sector.....	250
11.3. Summary .....	253
CONCLUSION AND THE WAY FORWARD .....	254
 INTERVIEWS.....	259

BIBLIOGRAPHY .....	260
1. Cases.....	260
2. Books / Sections of Books.....	261
3. Journal Articles.....	268
4. Laws and Regulations .....	278
5. Agreements, MOUs in the area of competition policy.....	279
6. Latin American Agreements .....	282
7. Official Documentation from ICN, OECD and UNCTAD.....	283
8. Reports, web materials and sources .....	288
Academic Dissertations .....	308
9. Presentations Made by Competition Enforcers .....	308