

Content Overview

Abstract	1
Content Overview	II
Table of Contents	III
Abbreviations	IX
Bibliography	XIII
Other documents and materials	XXXIII
Table of cases	XXXIX
Table of figures and tables	XLVI
Introduction	1
Part I: The concept and protection of new minorities in a fragmented international legal order	11
Chapter 1: Definition and delimitation of the research framework	12
Chapter 2: The individual complaints mechanisms of the ECtHR and the UNHRC	39
Part II: The protection of new minorities' right to freedom of religion by the ECtHR	75
Chapter 3: The right to freedom of religion and belief as guaranteed by the ECHR	76
Chapter 4: A typology of the ECtHR's case law regarding new minorities' right to freedom of religion	93
Chapter 5: A closer look at the reasoning adopted in the relevant case law of the ECtHR	111
Part III: The protection of new minorities' right to freedom of religion by the UNHRC	145
Chapter 6: The right to freedom of religion and belief as guaranteed by the ICCPR	146
Chapter 7: New minorities' right to freedom of religion in the case law of the UNHRC	165
Part IV: New minorities' right to freedom of religion in the case law of the ECtHR and the UNHRC: Coherence or divergence?	181
Chapter 8: Pinpointing divergence in the interpretation and application of new minorities' right to freedom of religion	182
Chapter 9: Explaining and mitigating divergence in the international protection of the right to freedom of religion from a new minorities perspective	202
Conclusion	247
Appendix of cases included in the empirical research	254

Table of Contents

Abstract	I
Content Overview	II
Table of Contents	III
Abbreviations	IX
Bibliography	XIII
Other documents and materials	XXXIII
Table of cases	XXXIX
<i>I. Cases of the ECtHR and the EComHR</i>	<i>XXXIX</i>
<i>II. Cases of the UNHRC</i>	<i>XLIII</i>
<i>III. Other cases</i>	<i>XLIV</i>
Table of figures and tables	XLVI
Introduction	1
<i>I. New minorities' right to freedom of religion: Unclear international standards</i>	<i>1</i>
<i>II. Research questions and hypotheses</i>	<i>6</i>
<i>III. Methodology</i>	<i>8</i>
<i>IV. Structure</i>	<i>9</i>
Part I: The concept and protection of new minorities in a fragmented international legal order	11
Chapter 1: Definition and delimitation of the research framework	12
<i>I. About pluralism, constitutionalism and fragmentation</i>	<i>12</i>
1. Divergence within International Human Rights Law	13
2. Divergence and religious freedom	15
<i>II. New minorities and religious freedom: Conceptual issues</i>	<i>16</i>
1. Legal definitions of the concepts 'minority' and 'new minority'	18
2. New minorities as religious minorities?	28
3. Distinguishing old and new minorities	30
<i>III. Current challenges in the protection of new minorities' religious freedom</i>	<i>34</i>
1. Challenges encountered by new minorities	34
2. A short account of approaches to dealing with religious diversity	36
3. New minorities and the international protection of their religious freedom	37

Chapter 2: The individual complaints mechanisms of the ECtHR and the UNHRC	39
I. The European Court of Human Rights	40
1. The evolution of the supervisory system of the ECHR	40
2. Judges and organisation of the ECtHR	42
3. Admissibility criteria for individual complaints	45
4. Decision-making process	48
5. Legal status and execution of the adopted judgment	49
6. Current challenges	51
II. The United Nations Human Rights Committee	52
1. Membership of the UNHRC	53
2. Functions of the UNHRC	54
3. Admissibility criteria for individual communications	56
4. Decision-making process	59
5. Legal status of the adopted decisions	61
6. Legal nature of the UNHRC	64
III. The relationship of the ECHR and the ICCPR and their supervisory bodies	65
1. The normative regulation of the relationship of the ECtHR and the ICCPR	65
2. A potential for divergence?	68
IV. Empirical research of the UNHRC's and the ECtHR's case law	69
1. Data collection and coding	70
2. Data coding and analysis	72
Part II: The protection of new minorities' right to freedom of religion by the ECtHR	75
Chapter 3: The right to freedom of religion and belief as guaranteed by the ECHR	76
I. The scope of the right to freedom of religion and belief	77
II. The development of general principles	80
III. Negative and positive obligations	82
IV. Justification of an interference with the right to manifest religious beliefs	83
1. Condition of legality	84
2. Condition of legitimacy	85
3. Condition of proportionality	86
V. The concept of the margin of appreciation	89
VI. Conclusion	91

Chapter 4: A typology of the ECtHR's case law regarding new minorities' right to freedom of religion	93
I. The parties to the procedure	94
1. The applicants	94
2. The respondent state	96
II. The adopted decisions	97
1. General observations	98
2. The religious beliefs of the applicant(s)	100
3. The respondent state	101
4. The decision-maker	103
III. The legal questions posed	105
1. The aspect of the right to freedom of religion and belief	105
2. The context of the complaint	107
3. The state obligation	108
4. The legitimate aim pursued and the legal basis	109
IV. Conclusion	110
Chapter 5: A closer look at the reasoning adopted in the relevant case law of the ECtHR	111
I. The existence of an interference with Article 9 ECHR	111
II. Positive state obligations	113
III. The condition of legality	116
IV. The condition of legitimacy	120
V. General principles regarding the condition of proportionality	125
1. Two groups of general principles	126
2. Patterns of reference to general principles	128
VI. The condition of proportionality	130
1. Substantive and structural concepts of margin of appreciation	131
2. The influence of the margin of appreciation on the reasoning of the ECtHR	133
VII. The margin of appreciation left to states	137
1. Nature of the affected right or interest	138
2. European consensus and deference to national authorities	139
VIII. Conclusion	143

Part III: The protection of new minorities' right to freedom of religion by the UNHRC	145
Chapter 6: The right to freedom of religion and belief as guaranteed by the ICCPR	146
<i>I. The scope of the right to freedom of religion and belief</i>	<i>148</i>
1. The definition of religion and belief	148
2. Freedom to have or to change one's religion of belief	149
3. Freedom from coercion	150
4. Right to manifest religious beliefs	151
5. Religious education of children	154
6. Exemptions from neutral rules	155
<i>II. Negative and positive obligations</i>	<i>156</i>
<i>III. Justification of an interference with the right to manifest religious beliefs</i>	<i>157</i>
1. Condition of legality	158
2. Condition of legitimacy	159
3. Condition of proportionality	161
<i>IV. The concept of the margin of appreciation</i>	<i>162</i>
<i>V. Conclusion</i>	<i>164</i>
Chapter 7: New minorities' right to freedom of religion in the case law of the UNHRC	165
<i>I. A typology of relevant cases</i>	<i>165</i>
1. The parties to the procedure	166
2. The adopted decisions	167
3. The legal questions posed	168
4. Conclusion	170
<i>II. A closer look at the reasoning adopted in the specific cases</i>	<i>170</i>
1. The existence of an interference with Article 18 ICCPR	171
2. Positive state obligations	172
3. The condition of legality	173
4. The condition of legitimacy	173
5. The condition of proportionality	175
6. Conclusion	179

Part IV: New minorities' right to freedom of religion in the case law of the ECtHR and the UNHRC: Coherence or divergence?	181
Chapter 8: Pinpointing divergence in the interpretation and application of new minorities' right to freedom of religion	182
<i>I. Scales to measure the sufficient substantiation of complaints</i>	<i>183</i>
1. Comparison of the normative framework and its application	183
2. Admissibility reasoning in the case law regarding new minorities	184
<i>II. The bar set for fulfilling the condition of legitimacy</i>	<i>187</i>
1. Comparison of the normative framework and its application	188
2. Restrictions of new minorities' rights for the protection of the rights and freedoms of others	188
3. Lack of scrutiny of the legitimate aim pursued in cases concerning new minorities	191
<i>III. Scrutinising the fulfilment of the condition of proportionality</i>	<i>195</i>
1. Comparison of the normative framework and its application	195
2. Various levels of scrutiny in the assessment of the condition of proportionality	196
<i>IV. Conclusion</i>	<i>200</i>
Chapter 9: Explaining and mitigating divergence in the international protection of the right to freedom of religion from a new minorities perspective	202
<i>I. Explaining divergence: Institutional and conceptual differences</i>	<i>202</i>
1. Institutional differences	202
2. The concept of the margin of appreciation and new minorities' religious freedom	207
3. Looking at the applicants from a 'minority perspective'	219
<i>II. Mitigating divergence: A toolbox</i>	<i>228</i>
1. General remarks	229
2. Reasoning based on precedents	232
3. Reasoning based on states' margin of appreciation	234
4. References to case law of other international bodies	236
5. Systemic interpretation of state duties vis à vis minorities	241
<i>III. Conclusion</i>	<i>245</i>
Conclusion	247
<i>I. Divergence in the protection of new minorities' right to freedom of religion by the ECtHR and the UNHRC</i>	<i>247</i>

<i>II. Explaining divergence based on institutional and conceptual differences.....</i>	<i>249</i>
<i>III. A way forward: Mitigating divergence</i>	<i>250</i>
<i>Appendix of cases included in the empirical research.....</i>	<i>254</i>
<i>I. Cases of the EComHR and the ECtHR</i>	<i>254</i>
<i>II. Cases of the UNHRC.....</i>	<i>255</i>